



PROJECT MUSE[®]

From Liberal Multiculturalism to Civic Republicanism: An Historical Perspective on Multiculturalism Policy in Manitoba and Saskatchewan

Abstract

Most research on multiculturalism policy in Canada has focused on the federal government's multiculturalism policy or Quebec's interculturalism policy. However, the multicultural policies that have been active in English Canadian provinces over the last forty years have largely escaped scholarly attention. This article begins to fill this gap in knowledge on Canadian multiculturalism by examining the multiculturalism policies of the Saskatchewan and Manitoba provincial governments from the beginning of the 1970s to present. It argues that the ethos of multiculturalism policy in these two provinces has incrementally evolved from Anglo-conformity to liberal multiculturalism to civic republicanism. While the evolution toward civic republicanism is quite advanced in Manitoba, the Saskatchewan government has displayed less coherence in its multiculturalism policies. Generally speaking, the article finds that these uneven shifts in Saskatchewan and Manitoba multiculturalism have taken place in response to demographic change and the electoral calculations of the governing party. The lesson is that political considerations, as much as broader structural changes in society, are an important part of understanding multiculturalism policy in Canada.

Résumé

La plus grande partie de la recherche sur les politiques de multiculturalisme au Canada ont mis l'emphase soit sur celle du gouvernement fédéral, ou sur celle d'interculturalisme du Québec. Cependant, les politiques multiculturelles menées dans les provinces du Canada anglais depuis les quarante dernières années ont largement échappé à l'attention des chercheurs. Cet article commence à combler les lacunes dans les connaissances sur le multiculturalisme canadien portant sur les politiques des gouvernements provinciaux de la Saskatchewan et du Manitoba dans ce domaine depuis le début des années soixante-dix jusqu'à aujourd'hui. Nous y soutenons que l'éthos de ces politiques dans ces deux provinces a progressivement évolué de la conformité anglophone au multiculturalisme libéral et au républicanisme civique. Alors que l'évolution vers ce dernier est plutôt avancée au Manitoba, le gouvernement de la Saskatchewan a affiché moins de cohérence dans son évolution. De façon générale, nous constatons ici que les mutations dissemblables du multiculturalisme saskatchewanais et manitobain ont eu lieu en réponse aux changements démographiques et aux calculs électoraux du parti en place au gouvernement. La leçon à en tirer est que les considérations politiques jouent tout autant que des modifications structurelles plus générales au sein de la société un rôle important pour comprendre le multiculturalisme au Canada.



With the arrival of the 40th anniversary of the adoption of multiculturalism by the federal government, it is important to realize that almost all of the academic research on multiculturalism policy in Canada has related to the federal policy or the interculturalism policy of the Quebec provincial government. What has been neglected is the study of multiculturalism policies that have been active within Canadian provincial governments outside of Quebec for the last forty years. The only research on this subject is a journal article surveying all provincial *Multiculturalism Acts* or policy statements which finds these documents (with the exception of Quebec) generally emulate the federal multiculturalism policy (Garcea 2006), and a recent book chapter that places provincial multiculturalism acts into a larger web of provincial human rights, anti-racism, and employment equity programs (Garcea and Hibbert 2011).

Since there are almost no secondary sources on Saskatchewan and Manitoba multiculturalism policies, this article pieces together the policies of these provinces in this area using archival resources consisting of provincial government documents and legislative debates and committees (See Appendix A). This article broadly defines provincial multiculturalism policies as education policies concerning the teaching of heritage languages and multiculturalism; the grants given by provincial governments to ethnocultural groups or special projects to promote multiculturalism; and anti-racism strategies and policies. These policies are distinct from the immigration policies that provincial governments have developed in the areas of recruitment, selection, settlement, and retention (See Kordan 2011; Biles et al. 2011).

The overarching argument of this article is that the ethos of Saskatchewan and Manitoba's multiculturalism policies has incrementally evolved from Anglo-conformity to liberal multiculturalism to civic republicanism. While the move to civic republicanism is quite advanced in Manitoba, the Saskatchewan government has less coherence in its multiculturalism policies, displaying a mixture of liberal multiculturalism and civic republicanism. Generally speaking, the article finds that these uneven shifts in Saskatchewan and Manitoba multiculturalism policy have taken place as governments attempt to react to shifts in demographics in ways that would enhance their chances of electoral success with key ethnocultural communities while not angering a larger spectrum of voters who resist any "special treatment" for specific groups. As such, analysts should always be aware that electoral considerations, as much as broader structural changes in society, impact multiculturalism policy in Canada.

Given that Garcea found that the multiculturalism acts and policy statements of English Canadian provincial governments mirror the federal government's *Multiculturalism Act*, one may expect to find a large congruence between federal multiculturalism policy and multiculturalism policy in Saskatchewan and Manitoba. However, while the evolution of multiculturalism in these two provinces was quite similar to the evolution of the federal government's multiculturalism policies, it is not

a carbon copy. Due to particular local circumstances, anti-racism has never become an important part of multiculturalism programs in these provinces and heritage languages have been stressed more than at the federal level. The stress on heritage languages originates in the fact that education is a provincial jurisdiction and that the influential Central and Eastern European ethnic groups in these provinces stressed the learning of languages as part of their efforts at cultural preservation during the 1970s and 1980s. In contrast, the federal government has no control over the teaching of languages in publicly funded schools and is more attuned to French-English bilingualism. Furthermore, the anti-racism programming in these two provinces focuses on racism against Aboriginal peoples as opposed to racism against new immigrants. As such, anti-racism is conceived as being part of these provincial governments' First Nations policies, not their multiculturalism policies.

THE ETHOS OF PRAIRIE MULTICULTURALISM

When examining the history of multiculturalism in Saskatchewan and Manitoba, it is possible to identify three distinct ethos operating behind provincial government policy. The first ethos that operated until the 1970s could be labelled Anglo-conformity. Anglo-conformity can be seen as part of the broader white settler construct written about by Jhappan and Stasiulis that "refers to the intentions of colonial administrators to build in Canada an 'overseas extension' or replica of British society" (Stasiulis and Jhappan 1995, 97). The clear goal was not to manage or accommodate ethnic diversity but to eliminate it through assimilation. Provincial policies to enforce Anglo-conformity included English-only public schools and curricula that stressed pride in Canada's membership in the British Empire as well as the superiority of British culture.

Liberal multiculturalism is the opposite of Anglo-conformity and is best represented by the ideas of Pierre Trudeau during his time as Prime Minister. In his statement to the House of Commons that articulated the federal government's first multiculturalism policy, Trudeau maintained that, while there may be two official languages, there is no official Canadian culture and no ethnic group takes precedence over another (Trudeau 1971). For Trudeau, individuals should be given the freedom to practice their homeland culture and to participate in the cultural traditions of others (Forbes 2007, 29). For such cultural freedom to be realized, the state supports the individual's choice to preserve their homeland culture as opposed to assimilating into the dominant culture. The state has a responsibility to provide support for the preservation of homeland cultures, and members of cultural minorities have the responsibility of sharing their cultures with all of society in exchange for that support. Diversity is managed through respecting individuals' right to choose

their own cultural expression and through sharing minority cultures with the majority in order to generate acceptance of diversity within the general public. Provincial public policies that would be exemplary of liberal multiculturalism would be direct financial grants to ethnocultural associations for cultural retention activities and public support for “multicultural” festivals or museums meant to share the culture of non-British and non-French immigrants with the broader public.

In the early 1990s, liberal multiculturalism came under attack from sources such as MPs from the federal Progressive Conservative Party (PCs) and the federal Liberal Party, right-wing academics, the Bloc Québécois, and “fifth force” immigrant writers like Neil Bissoondath (Abu-Laban and Stasiulis 1992; Roy 1995). While the federal government’s response to this attack has been analyzed (Abu-Laban and Gabriel 2002; Ryan 2010), little attention has been paid to the effect that this attack had on multiculturalism at the provincial level. In Manitoba (and to lesser extent, Saskatchewan), the response to these attacks could be termed civic republicanism. Civic republicanism is a philosophical school of thought stretching back to the writings of Aristotle, Cicero, Machiavelli, and Rousseau. Iseult Honohan argues that the idea “that citizens need to be concerned with the common good and to take some personal responsibility for realising it is one of the longest-standing themes of civic republicanism, which flows from understanding citizens as engaged in a political community” (2002, 145). She argues that current debates of civic republicanism revolve around instilling civic virtue in citizens through encouraging their participation in society and politics.

As an approach to managing ethnic diversity, civic republicanism does not try to abolish the existence of diverse homeland cultures through assimilation as does Anglo-conformity. However, unlike liberal multiculturalism, neither does civic republicanism place an emphasis on cultural preservation and cultural sharing. Rather, civic republicanism recognizes the individual’s right to retain his or her homeland culture but holds that the preservation of homeland culture should not be an important consideration of state policy. Rather, the primary consideration is for the state to encourage cultural minorities to participate and integrate into the polity in order to forge a sense of shared values. The individual is encouraged to retain his or her homeland culture—but only to the extent that it does not interfere with his or her participation in the broader polity.

At first glance, civic republicanism seems very similar to Quebec’s model of interculturalism. However, there is one crucial difference. Quebec interculturalism puts forth the idea that there is a dominant public culture with which new immigrants must participate because the civic Québécois nation, with its unique language, history, and culture, is the principal defining feature of Quebec society (Karmis 2004; Gagnon and Iacovino 2007). Conversely, Honohan argues that civic

republican polities need not be based on the recognition of an overarching nationality but that “republican solidarity is better understood as a commitment to the people with whom we are interdependent in the polity” (2002, 281). Unlike Quebec interculturalism, there is no explicit mention of a dominant culture to which newcomers must integrate within the civic republicanism of Manitoba and Saskatchewan. Rather, similar to what Kernerman (2006) and Winter (2007) have found in the case of Canada, the province is held to a multicultural polity that supposedly has no single dominant culture within it. Government documents suggest that newcomers integrate into a pre-existing multicultural polity called “Manitoba” and “Saskatchewan” whose values and identity is the product of a multicultural history dating back to Confederation. Saskatchewan’s culture and Manitoba’s culture are, in their essence, multicultural. At the same time, there are clear suggestions that there are certain values, norms, and levels of participation that newcomers are expected to embrace and follow. As such, a newcomer can retain his or her homeland culture but must conform to the “mainstream” practices of the province that are themselves a product of British cultural heritage. Ultimately, the extent to which the shared values and shared identity of civic republicanism in Saskatchewan and Manitoba are actually the values and identity of the cultural majority is an unresolved tension within civic republicanism and remains unclear within public documents pertaining to this issue.

While the term civic republicanism has not been used in literature on Canadian multiculturalism before, several researchers have identified elements of civic republicanism within the English Canadian experience and the policies of the federal government. Both Kernerman (2006) and Winter (2007, 2011) have written about the English Canadian conception of multiculturalism within which all cultures are deemed equal, and the fundamental basis of the English Canadian polity is “multicultural” as opposed to being based on a single nationality. In their conceptualization of civic multiculturalism, Fleras and Elliott identify the importance of “civic participation” and “identity” to recent federal multiculturalism policy (2002, 68). In his more recent work, Fleras discusses how federal multiculturalism policy “engages in a politics of difference without capitulating to chaos or abandoning a commitment to community, consensus, and cohesion” (2009, 57-58). On a more theoretical level, Paquet outlines a “citizenship triangle” in Canadian multiculturalism that encompasses belonging, participation, and status (2008, 71-72).

The concept of an ethos of civic republicanism within Saskatchewan and Manitoba multiculturalism policy is intended to meld together these insights into the nature of contemporary Canadian multiculturalism outside of Quebec. The key for civic republicanism is that no one should have to give up one’s culture or change it drastically but that the state must lead citizens to integrate and participate in the

polity to ensure that the formation of shared values and a shared sense of belonging are formed. As we will see below, this goal means the de-emphasizing of provincial policies aimed at the retention of homeland culture such as the teaching of heritage languages or direct grants to ethnocultural groups for the purposes of cultural preservation. Rather, the provincial government shifts its emphasis and funding to policies that focus on fostering integration, participation, and shared values. In the Manitoba case, such policies include ESL classes, classes to enhance the understanding of Canadian citizenship among newcomers, settlement services explaining the province's culture, grants to ethnocultural groups for intercultural exchange projects, and a K-12 curriculum that stresses the interdependence of ethnic groups and dual identities (Canadian and one's homeland culture). As we will see, contemporary Saskatchewan policies embrace some of these civic republican themes but are much less developed.

IMPOSING ANGLO-CONFORMITY (1870-1969)

In the ten years after the Red River Rebellion (1870-1880), Manitoba's population increased from 12,000 to 63,000 due to the arrival of new arrivals almost exclusively from Ontario (Coates and McGuinness 1987, 6-20). The new Ontarian majority seized control of the provincial government and passed laws that created English public schools teaching Protestantism, and made English the sole official language of Manitoba (Jaenen 1978). While these laws were temporarily loosened in the early 20th century to allow the teaching of other languages, the provincial government abolished bilingual schools in 1915, and instruction in any language other than English was prohibited. In her study of Manitoba public schools from 1915 to 1945, Bruno-Jofre illustrates that the aim of the provincial government in regard to Manitoba public schools was "to create a homogenous nation based on a common English Canadian language, a common culture, identification with the British Empire, and an acceptance of British institutions and practices" (1998-1999, 27).

Similar to Manitoba, the role of Saskatchewan's school system until the 1960s was to assimilate students into the English language and British-Canadian culture. Initially, the Saskatchewan provincial government permitted non-English languages to be the language of instruction for a very limited amount of time during the school day. However, the provincial government argued that limited instruction in non-English languages was a transitory stage that was needed to encourage non-British immigrant children to attend government-funded schools that would expose them to the English language and the British culture (Smith 1975, 116). Despite the government's insistence that a gradual approach to assimilation was the most prudent course of action, there was constant agitation on the part of English-speaking residents of Saskatchewan to make English the sole language of instruction (Macleod 1968, 140). Near the end of

World War I, the provincial government banned the teaching of languages other than English and made attendance compulsory at government regulated schools that taught a curriculum stressing patriotic pride in the British Empire (Regehr 2004, 52.)

When the CCF came to power, one of its first acts in office was the passage of the Saskatchewan Rights Bill in 1947 that prohibited discrimination on racial and religious grounds for any person attempting to obtain employment, engage in a business transaction, join a professional or trade association, rent or purchase any property, receive service from a hotel or restaurant, or gain admission to university (Patrias 2006). In tandem with the CCF's efforts to protect individual citizens from overt discrimination, there remained an expectation that all citizens in Saskatchewan would assimilate into British-Canadian culture and would not retain their homeland languages (Waiser 2009). The CCF government did not remove the restrictions on teaching languages other than English in Saskatchewan schools, and the curriculum of schools continued to instil a sense of pride in Saskatchewan's membership in the British Empire. In many ways, the CCF's thinking followed the federal government's efforts to "Canadianize" immigrants on the Prairies both during and after World War II (Caccia 2010; Day 2000, 146-176).

There was a mild thaw of Anglo-Conformity in Manitoba and Saskatchewan during the 1960s on the question of French language education. The Roblin government in Manitoba voiced its support for the principles of bilingualism and biculturalism by passing Bill 59 which expanded the use of French in Manitoba's schools in recognition of the role of Francophones in founding Canada and Manitoba (Russell 2003, 216-220). Likewise, following the release of the Bilingualism and Biculturalism Commission, the Thatcher government in Saskatchewan allowed the establishment of Francophone minority schools and French immersion schools where 50%-80% of the instruction was in French. At a constitutional conference, Thatcher pointed out that the government took these steps "not so much for our own sake, but to prove to French-speaking Canadians elsewhere in Canada that we do indeed want to contribute to preserving national unity" (SK1968a). Thus, while the Manitoba and Saskatchewan governments recognized their provinces' internal French-English duality for the sake of national unity, assimilation remained their primary method of managing the cultural diversity produced by immigrants who did not fit into either of Canada's founding nations.

THE ERA OF LIBERAL MULTICULTURALISM (1969-1990)

By the late 1960s, a demographic shift began in Manitoba. The assimilation of Manitoba's second- and third-generation German, Ukrainian, and Jewish immigrants during the era of Anglo-conformity was becoming evident. As such, these

groups expressed anxiety about losing their language and cultural traditions and were concerned about the discrimination that they continued to face in their daily lives despite their high levels of education and social capital. Soon, such anxiety spilled over into the realm of the province's electoral competition. Until the 1960s, most non-British Manitobans had voted either Liberal or Conservative based on direct promises by those parties to their ethnic groups, establishing a tradition of ethnic clientism in Manitoba politics (Peterson 1972). In 1967, Premier Roblin retired and he was replaced by Walter Weir who represented "the traditional WASPish, rural and small town side" of the PCs (Adams 2008, 41). Weir reversed Roblin's support of bilingualism and opposed the findings of the Bilingualism and Biculturalism Commission as well as Trudeau's *Official Language Act*. In contrast, New Democratic Party (NDP) leader Ed Schreyer supported official bilingualism and the findings of the Bilingualism and Biculturalism Commission during the 1969 provincial election. In that election, the support of many second- and third-generation East Europeans swung behind the NDP, and Schreyer became Manitoba's first non-Anglo Saxon Premier and went on to appoint a very ethnically diverse cabinet (Wiseman 1983, 127).

In its 1970 Throne Speech, the Schreyer government promised to hold a conference of representatives of the province's ethnocultural communities on Manitoba's "Cultural Mosaic" so that they may express their views on "measures needed to nourish and sustain their linguistic and cultural heritage" (MB1970a). At the conference, Schreyer spoke of two challenges that his government would meet: "The first challenge is to preserve a meaningful cultural identity for each of the diverse groups in our society. The second challenge is to bring into society as a whole the maximum cultural contribution from each of those groups" (MB1970b). He stated that "harmony" in Manitoba can only result if the state acts to make ethnic groups feel secure in their identity and encourages them to share their cultures with all Manitobans.

Delegates to the conference voted in favour of a resolution endorsing the recommendations of the fourth volume of the Biculturalism and Bilingualism Commission as well as other resolutions calling for grants to "ethnic organizations which sponsor and maintain cultural projects" and the development of a curriculum by the Department of Education to reflect the "multi-cultural and multi-lingual reality of Manitoba" (MB1970b). Because federal bureaucrats had aided in planning the conference and its resolutions were forwarded to Ottawa, it is likely the Manitoba experience had some influence on policy planning at the federal level. Indeed, one year later, several parts of Trudeau's announcement of the federal government's multiculturalism policy echoed the ideas of the Manitoba conference.

As a result of the 1970 conference, an alliance formed between the province's ethnocultural associations and the East European and Central European members of

the NDP cabinet to initiate a shift from Anglo-conformity to liberal multiculturalism. Schreyer appointed a ministerial advisory committee on multiculturalism made up of representatives of Manitoba's various ethnic groups to advise his government. On the advice of the committee, the government implemented several liberal multicultural policies. In 1972, the same year as the federal government began its grants to ethnic groups (Pal 1993, 189-215), the Schreyer government created the Multiculturalism Grants Program which provided financial support to ethnic groups for operations and special projects (MB1973a). Given its jurisdiction over education, the Manitoba government was more aggressive in its policies to promote heritage languages than the federal government. The NDP government provided funding to heritage languages NGOs, created high school credits for passing heritage language tests, and permitted the teaching of heritage languages as a subject as early as kindergarten with the approval of the local school board (MB1992a). In terms of the sharing of immigrant homeland culture with the general public, the government funded various public festivals (such as Folklorama) and created museums dedicated to preserving and sharing the history of Manitoba's ethnic minorities (MB1971a; MB1972a; MB1973a; MB1974a; MB1975a; MB1976a; MB1977a).

While the short-lived Lyon PC government (1977-1981) was uninterested in liberal multiculturalism, it did not instigate a policy shift. The government abolished the ministerial advisory committee on multiculturalism but it never went as far as to eliminate any of the multiculturalism programs that had been introduced. Instead, it merely reduced their funding (MB1988a). In the 1981 provincial election, the PCs were defeated by the NDP under the leadership of Howard Pawley. Reflecting the continuing alliance between Manitoba's ethnocultural associations and the NDP, the party had worked with activists from these associations to develop a multicultural platform during its time in opposition which helped attract the electoral support of Winnipeg's ethnocultural groups, and to elect the province's first Asian (Filipino) MLA (MB1989a).

The Pawley government worked closely with Manitoba's ethnocultural groups to renew the province's liberal multiculturalism. A primary instrument of co-operation between the government and ethnic groups was the Manitoba Intercultural Council (MIC) that was made up of two-thirds members elected by their respective ethnocultural communities and one-third appointed by cabinet. It met regularly with the Minister responsible for multiculturalism and the newly-created Ethnocultural Affairs Committee of Cabinet (which included the Premier) to discuss the government's policies in the area of multiculturalism (MB1985a; MB1985b). The NDP government gave the MIC the important role of distributing money from provincial lotteries to ethnic organizations for operations, infrastructure, and special projects aimed at cultural preservation and cultural sharing.

Cultural preservation was also reinforced through the NDP's amendments to the *Public School Act* which expanded the teaching of heritage languages as an individual subject and established schools where 50% of the instruction was in Ukrainian, German, or Hebrew (MB1992a). The Pawley government pursued the recognition and sharing of Manitoba's cultural diversity through a grant program to preserve and display ethnocultural heritage artefacts and grants to promote contemporary ethnocultural art (MB1985c; MB1986a).

Similar to Manitoba, an important demographic shift had taken place in Saskatchewan in the late 1960s as many of the province's residents were second- or third-generation Eastern and Central Europeans concerned about losing their linguistic/cultural traditions and acutely aware of the discrimination that their ethnic group had historically faced (Waiser 2009, 68-71). Due to Saskatchewan's history of large scale immigration from East and Central Europe, the 1971 census reported 53% of Saskatchewan residents traced their origins to neither British nor French sources with the vast majority of these residents reporting to be German, Ukrainian, Scandinavian, Polish, Dutch, or Hungarian (SK1973a). As their levels of social capital and education increased, these "third force Canadians" rose to very prominent positions in Saskatchewan and began to openly question the validity of Anglo-conformity which endangered their cultural heritage. Soon multiculturalism was an issue that entered into the electoral competition of the province as the NDP won several ridings with high populations of non-British ethnic groups in both the rural and urban areas. While few non-Anglo-Saxons had ever ascended to powerful positions in the Saskatchewan government, Premier Allan Blakeney placed several Canadians of Central and East European descent into high-ranking positions in his cabinet such as Roy Romanow (Ukrainian), Ed Tchorzewski (Ukrainian), and Walter Smishek (Polish).

As minister responsible for multiculturalism, Tchorzewski became an eloquent spokesperson for Saskatchewan's Central and East European ethnocultural communities and aided the NDP in keeping the electoral support of these groups that was important in several of the province's closely contested ridings (Blakeney and Borins 1998, 14-21). His department organized a series of conferences where the Premier and members of cabinet met with representatives of the province's various ethnocultural groups. At these conferences, ethnocultural leaders expressed their strong desire for policies reflecting a liberal multiculturalism ethos such as the teaching of heritage languages and grants for cultural preservation (SK1973a).

Coming out of these conferences, the Blakeney government made the highly innovative move to provide a legislative basis for multiculturalism, and Saskatchewan became the first Canadian province to pass a multiculturalism act in 1974. In contrast, Ontario was the next province to legislate a multiculturalism act

in 1982, and the federal government did not pass its multiculturalism act until 1988. Saskatchewan's 1974 *Multiculturalism Act* is an excellent reflection of the Blakeney government's conception of liberal multiculturalism that revolved around the preservation and sharing of the homeland cultures of Saskatchewan's pioneer ethnic groups. The Act defines multiculturalism as the "recognition of the right of every community, whose common history spans many generations, to retain its distinctive group identity, and to develop its relevant language and its traditional arts and sciences, without political or social impediment and for the mutual benefit of all citizens" (SK1974a). The Act set up a system of grants to be paid out by the Department of Culture and Youth to groups or individuals who wanted to learn about their own cultural heritage and learn about the contribution of other ethnic groups to Saskatchewan. The legislation contained a series of conditions to be placed on the grants that made it clear that the goal of the government's multiculturalism policies was not cultural preservation for the sake of cultural preservation. The grants would only be allocated to organizations and projects that developed materials, displays, or programs which were either used in the province's schools or aimed at educating the public about Saskatchewan's multicultural heritage. The Act also reflected the alliance between Saskatchewan's ethnocultural associations and the NDP cabinet. It created the Saskatchewan Multicultural Advisory Council that was appointed by cabinet from representatives of the province's ethnocultural associations and tasked with reviewing applications for multicultural grants before they were recommended to the minister for final approval (SK1974b).

Throughout the rest of its time in power, the Blakeney government's main objective in the area of multiculturalism was cultural preservation coupled with an attempt to "develop a sensitivity to and an appreciation of, Saskatchewan's diverse ethno-cultural heritage among the people of the province" (SK1974c). The main instrument for developing a sense of public pride in Saskatchewan's multicultural heritage was the Multicultural Festival Program which provided annual funding for a folk festival in every region of the province (SK1980a, SK1982a). In terms of cultural preservation, the government created a bursary program for students to travel outside of Saskatchewan to study the language and fine arts of their cultural heritage (SK1976a, SK1977a, SK1978a, SK1979a). More importantly, the government was quite aggressive in promoting heritage languages. The School Act was amended to permit a language other than English or French to be taught or used as a language of instruction for up to 50% of the school day (SK1974d). A number of school boards negotiated with the Department of Education for high school credits for students learning heritage languages, and a small number of bilingual Ukrainian-English programs were created (SK1986a).

Under the leadership of Grant Devine, the PCs won a surprise victory in the

1982 Saskatchewan provincial election but they did not campaign on issues of immigration or multiculturalism. Reflective of the PCs' lack of attention to Saskatchewan's cultural diversity and the Devine government's pursuit of other priorities, there were few notable changes made to the structure of multiculturalism programs during Devine's time in power. The provincial government continued to fund folk festivals, heritage language programs, and special projects dedicated to sharing the cultural heritage of the province's ethnocultural groups with the general public (SK1983a; SK1984a; SK1985a; SK1986a; SK1990a). There was, however, an important change in the way in which these activities were funded as the PC government decided to provide additional funding to multiculturalism programs through lottery money. By the end of the PCs' time in power, the lottery funding for multiculturalism had increased substantially but the amount of funding being paid out of the General Revenue Fund to multiculturalism programs had decreased (SK1989a).

THE RISE OF CIVIC REPUBLICANISM (1990-2012)

In Manitoba, the origins of the gradual shift toward civic republicanism lie in the rise of fears over the extension of "special status" to particular groups during the decade from 1983 to 1993 that played out in the context of the national question (i.e., Quebec's place in Canada) and French-English relations within the province itself. From 1983 to 1985, the Pawley government ignited a firestorm of controversy with its proposal for a constitutional amendment declaring Manitoba a bilingual province and extending French language government services (Doern 1985; Hébert 2004). Following this controversy, hostility to the Meech Lake Accord was especially fierce in Manitoba (Wiseman 1994). By the early 1990s, opposition to elevating the status of French in Manitoba and giving Quebec some sort of special status morphed into the questioning of accommodating diversity in any form. In 1990, a prominent PC MP from Winnipeg made front page news when she characterized her own government's multiculturalism policy as "divisive" (Alexandra 1990). A year later, on a platform that called for the elimination of federal multiculturalism policies, a lowering of Canada's immigration levels, and a scaling back of official bilingualism, the Reform Party broke through in the federal election, winning 22.4% of the popular vote in Manitoba.

Insofar as liberal multiculturalism gave support to ethnocultural groups to preserve their culture, it was at odds with a growing public backlash against any government program or policy that appeared to give "special status" to a particular group. However, as the 1990s wore on, the Manitoba government realized that increased immigration from a number of different sources (including countries outside of Europe) was necessary for the economic health of the province due to demographic factors such as an aging population and the outflow of young people. If non-European

immigrants coming to Manitoba could claim special group rights concerning the cultural preservation inherent in liberal multiculturalism, it could drain public support for large-scale immigration. The problem was simple: how to increase the immigration needed for economic growth when Manitoba society was expressing reservations about accommodating ethnic diversity? The answer was civic republicanism.

In May 1990, the Filmon minority government introduced Manitoba's first official multiculturalism policy that marked the beginning of a shift from liberal multiculturalism towards a civic republican perspective that stressed integration, participation, and shared values. During the crisis over bilingualism in Manitoba, the PCs had argued in favour of Anglo-conformity by asserting that Manitoba always was and always should be an "English" province (Hébert 2004, 104-107). To counter the PCs' Anglo-centric image, the policy asserts that "the fact of multiculturalism—a variety of races and cultures having to find ways to live together," has always been part of Manitoba due to its multicultural heritage (MB1990a). Indeed, the Minister responsible for multiculturalism insisted that, since the province's First Nations had different languages and customs before Europeans arrived, Manitoba had been multicultural "from the beginning of time" (MB1992e). At the same time, there was a shift away from the focus on cultural preservation and cultural sharing of the Schreyer and Pawley governments as well as the denial of special status for any particular group or minority culture. The 1990 policy maintained that Manitoba is both a "multicultural society" and a "single society—united by shared laws, aspirations, and responsibilities" (MB1990a). In this unified and multicultural society, new and established ethnic groups face the "dual challenge" of integrating while, at the same time, enhancing their homeland cultures (Ibid.).

After the Filmon government won a majority, the Multiculturalism Act was introduced in the Legislature. The Act codified the "multicultural ideal" that had been presented in the May 1990 policy and created a multiculturalism secretariat and a minister responsible for multiculturalism to implement the *Act* (MB1992b). The Act was passed unanimously with the opposition parties expressing strong support for its "unity through diversity" approach and the government stressing how its vision of multiculturalism was in line with the Canada Clause contained in the proposed Charlottetown Accord (MB1992c). While they were concerned with strengthening the teaching of heritage languages and anti-racism programs, representatives of ethnic groups that presented at the committee hearings for the *Act* were quite supportive of the legislation (MB1992e). Indeed, a report by the umbrella group for ethnic communities in Manitoba argued that cultural preservation should be supplemented with programs concentrating on integration, settlement, and combating racism in order to make multiculturalism a "unifying factor for all communities under the umbrella of Canadian unity and Canadian nationalism" (MB1992i).

The new Act set out a clear framework for the Filmon government's multiculturalism policy which began to exhibit a strong tendency towards civic republicanism. For instance, the provincial government abdicated its leadership role in expanding the teaching of heritage languages. Under a new policy, heritage language classes and bilingual heritage language schools could be created only on the initiative of the individual school board, provided that the Department of Education had an approved curriculum for the language, judged that qualified teachers were available, and determined that the enrolment was sufficient (MB1992f). As opposed to focusing on cultural preservation, state support for heritage languages was justified by arguing that multilingualism is an asset in an era of globalization, and, since heritage language classes are open to all students regardless of ethnic background, their study promotes understanding of Manitoba's multicultural identity (Ibid.). The Filmon government further downplayed the cultural preservation and cultural recognition aspects of liberal multiculturalism by enacting a policy whereby there would be no art grants specific to ethnocultural art, and all art grants would be awarded based only on artistic merit (MB1992d). The government's new focus on removing barriers to participation and integration was apparent in new grants for ethnocultural organizations to create projects aimed at improving their members' understanding of Canadian citizenship (MB1992g; MB1993a).

The most important advance in multiculturalism policy by the Filmon government was the creation of the province's first multiculturalism curriculum for K-12 schools. The new curriculum stressed three aspects of the government's new civic republican approach. First, the curriculum encouraged the duality of identity through activities which assisted students in developing a "strong sense of personal identity as Canadians and as members of their ethnocultural groups" (MB1992h). Second, the curriculum sought to make students appreciate the equal contribution of all ethnocultural groups to Canadian society, and to realize the "interdependence of all ethnocultural groups" (Ibid.). Finally, the curriculum stressed the right and responsibility of people of all ethnic backgrounds to fully participate in Canadian society. In pursuit of the goal of encouraging participation, the Filmon government created new ESL programs in schools for immigrant children during class hours to quicken their integration into Manitoba's broader society (MB1993b).

Ultimately, the Filmon government's embrace of civic republicanism was connected to electoral considerations and Manitoba's economic interest that was endangered by demographic shifts. Its initial embrace of civic republicanism can be explained by his attempts to re-brand the PCs as a party representing all parts of Manitoba society in order to attract votes from ethnic groups in key swing ridings in Winnipeg (Adams 2008, 46-54). The movement towards civic republicanism offered a contrast to both the Anglo-conformity traditionally associated with the PCs and

the liberal multiculturalism associated with the NDP. As his mandate progressed, Filmon also began to find civic republicanism to be useful for his economic agenda that highlighted the importance of immigration from diverse non-European sources to respond to demographic challenges. The Manitoba government feared a shortage of skilled labourers as the province's share of immigration dropped in proportion to its share of Canada's population (MB1994a). As such, the government began a variety of aggressive recruitment efforts, including signing provincial nominee agreements with the federal government, overseas promotional tours, international advertising, a 24-hour Winnipeg-based call center, and co-operation with immigration officers in Canadian embassies to promote Manitoba as a destination for new immigrants (MB1998b; MB1999a). Civic republicanism reassured the Manitoba population that the provincial state would work hard to integrate the newcomers from increased immigration as opposed to just providing them resources with which to retain their homeland culture.

Interestingly, the NDP provincial government under the leadership of Gary Doer and Greg Selinger has followed almost exactly the same policies in the areas of multiculturalism and immigration as the Filmon government. By the time that the NDP came to power in 1999, the province's business community was arguing that a widespread consensus had formed in Manitoba society which held that a "demographic meltdown" was coming due to the province's aging population, falling birth rate, young people leaving the province, and low levels of immigration that would result in chronic labour shortages, declining economic growth, a dwindling population, lower government revenues, and an overall decrease in the quality of life (MB2001a). In response to this "doomsday scenario," the Manitoba Business Council, made up of the CEOs of the 60 largest corporations in Manitoba, called on the government to create a "community-based, all sectors approach" to compete in the international competition for skilled immigrant workers (Ibid.). The Doer government responded by making immigration a pillar of its economic strategy and creating a number of overseas recruitment campaigns centered on the provincial nominee program (MB2005a; MB2007a; MB2007b; MB2008a). Reflecting a civic republican orientation, the government redesigned the assessment criteria of its nominee program to focus on nominating immigrants who easily integrate into Manitoba and, therefore, would reside in the province for a long period of time. In 2008, the government noted that the profile of the typical immigrant to Manitoba was a person who has secured a job, speaks English, has family in Manitoba, and came from a country whose ex-patriots have already established a presence in the province (MB2008b). At the same time, the government expanded its funding to immigrant settlement NGOs and created its own four-week orientation to Manitoba and Canadian culture for new arrivals (MB2004a). Reflecting civic republicanism,

the government stressed settlement services designed to integrate immigrants into Manitoba society, such as ESL training and citizenship classes (MC2007c).

In comparison to these bold moves on immigration policy, multiculturalism policy now appears to be an afterthought in Manitoba. In 2007-2008, the Manitoba government spent \$23.7 million on immigrant recruitment and settlement but only \$682,000 on multiculturalism programs (MB2008b). Since the Manitoba government does not publicly release a list of the multiculturalism projects that it funds, a Freedom of Information Request was required to get a sense of the grants given to ethnocultural groups. During the 2002-2003 fiscal year, over 80% of the monies within the Ethnocultural Community Support Program were allocated to "Heritage Languages and Cultural Preservation" and 20% was allocated to "Intercultural Exchange and Education." However, by 2007-2008, the ratio had been re-balanced with half of the monies going to each category. It seems that intercultural exchange as a method to promote Manitoba's multicultural identity is gaining in importance over cultural preservation.

While the Multiculturalism Secretariat is the sole body responsible for anti-racism in the Manitoba provincial government, its current activity in this area is very limited. Using money from the federal government that was made available as a component of the Martin government's Action Plan Against Racism, the Secretariat runs a small program to fund anti-racism projects by local NGOs (MB2008c). Anti-racism funding amounted to only \$4,732 in 2008-2009 according to a Freedom of Information request.

The NDP government continues the Filmon government's policies on heritage languages (MB2008d; MB2008e) and has adopted reforms to the teaching of multiculturalism in K-12 schools that are congruent with civic republicanism. Indeed, the principles driving the education reforms were that "all students and families must have equitable opportunities to participate fully in the education system in Manitoba" and that schools "encourage a sense of community and belonging that promotes socially responsible behaviour and action" (MB2006b). To achieve this goal, the government has increased ESL, launched a public awareness campaign concerning the need to accommodate diversity in schools, and supported the hiring of more teachers from ethnic minorities. When it comes to combating racism, the curriculum focuses on "developing an appreciation and informed knowledge about the unique place of Aboriginal peoples in Canada as an essential part of anti-racism education" (Ibid.). It appears that to the extent that the Manitoba government does have an anti-racism policy, it is oriented towards combating racism against Aboriginal peoples as opposed to immigrants.

In Saskatchewan, the NDP under Roy Romanow were elected to office in 1991. Unlike Manitoba in the early 1990s, Saskatchewan had a very small Francophone

population and a small population of new immigrants (SK2008a) so the debates around multiculturalism and national unity were not taken up with the same vigour (Leeson 1990). As the province's economy grew, the Romanow government decided to concentrate on expanding skills training to fill the needs of the expanding labour market as opposed to immigration (SK1995a). The Romanow government was further aided in filling Saskatchewan's labour market needs because baby boomers had not yet begun to retire and negative interprovincial migration was slowing (SK2009a). As such, the Romanow government was uninterested in attracting and settling immigrants since it felt that Saskatchewan's economic prosperity could go on unabated with minimal international immigration. Indeed, the only notable move by the Romanow government in the area of immigration was the creation of a small provincial nominee program that had only attracted 48 immigrants by the time that Romanow left office (SK2001a).

As opposed to national unity, multiculturalism, or immigration, it is clear that deficit elimination through spending cuts and tax increases was the overriding priority during the Romanow years (Marchildon 2004). In this context of fiscal restraint, the low number of immigrants in Saskatchewan meant a small lobby to advocate for increased spending on immigrant settlement or public funding to support ethnocultural communities. The task of lobbying for multiculturalism programs generally fell to third- and fourth-generation immigrants from Eastern and Central Europe. However, Saskatchewan's third- and fourth-generation immigrants were getting further removed from the ethnic heritage of their grandparents and great-grandparents through intermarriage and the slow processes of assimilation, especially in terms of language. The 2001 census shows a decrease in the number of people who spoke heritage languages in Saskatchewan as well as a large increase in the number of people reporting multiple ethnic origins and people identifying themselves as simply "Canadian" (Statistics Canada 2003). At the same time, the percentage of Aboriginal peoples in Saskatchewan increased from 9.7% of the population to 13.5% during the 1990s (Anderson 2005), crowding out concerns about ethnic diversity related to new immigrants or pioneer ethnocultural communities. Due to the Romanow government's ambivalence and the federal government's lack of attention to the geographical distribution of immigrants during most of the 1990s, 20,013 immigrants came to Saskatchewan from 1991 to 2001 and only 57% of those immigrants stayed in Saskatchewan (compared to 41,640 immigrants in Manitoba with a retention rate of 78% over the same time period) (Elliott 2003, 49). By 2001, immigrants (defined as residents not born in Canada) made up only 5% of Saskatchewan's population compared with 12% in Manitoba and 15% in Alberta. Most of Saskatchewan immigrants had been in the province for many years (Ibid. 50).

Given the relative unimportance of immigration to the province's economy and a lack of interest groups pushing the issue, other problems such as the deficit and Aboriginal policy dominated public discourse as immigration and multiculturalism were buried deep within the provincial state apparatus. In the rash of spending cuts by the Romanow government, all of the liberal multicultural initiatives that dated from the Blakeney era such as grants for out-of-school heritage language programs and funding for special projects dedicated to sharing the cultural heritage of the province's ethnic groups with the general public were eliminated (SK1993a; SK1995c; SK1996a; SK1996b; SK1996c). The Department of Recreation, Multiculturalism, and Culture was abolished and the responsibility for cultural policy, including the Multiculturalism Act, was shifted to the Department of Municipal Government (SK1994a; SK1995b).

After the cost-cutting settled down, the NDP passed a new Multiculturalism Act in 1997 that was originally drafted by a committee of representatives from ethnocultural groups. This committee of ethnocultural representatives argued that the emphasis of the 1974 Multiculturalism Act on cultural preservation, cultural sharing, and heritage languages was outdated. While it held that these traditional liberal multicultural concerns remained an essential part of multiculturalism, it contended that Saskatchewan's updated legislation should reflect new civic republican themes such as anti-racism, immigrant settlement, and ensuring that "all citizens participate in the province's economic, social, and cultural opportunities" (SK1996d).

Following the recommendation of the committee, the new Act combined aspects of liberal multiculturalism and civic republicanism. It stated that the policy of the Government of Saskatchewan was to "preserve, strengthen, and promote all cultures," acknowledge the role of ethnic communities in building Saskatchewan, recognize the different languages spoken in the province, and enhance intercultural understanding (SK1997a). There was also a clear civic republican thrust in the legislation. The Act clarified that the cultural development of ethnic minorities must take place in the framework of "democratic principles and laws of Canada" and stipulated that the provincial government will promote the "full, free and equal participation of all individuals in Saskatchewan society" and "facilitate the settlement of immigrants in Saskatchewan and their adaptation to and integration into Saskatchewan society." In introducing the legislation, the NDP Minister was clear that "we don't see the passage of this legislation costing, for instance, the taxpayers of Saskatchewan more money" (SK1997c). In fact, the new Act did not contain provisions for the creation of any new bureaucratic machinery to implement its vision of multiculturalism, such as a Multiculturalism Secretariat or a Saskatchewan Foundation for Multiculturalism as had been recommended by the committee of ethnocultural representatives.

Throughout the rest of its time in power, the NDP stayed true to the minister's claim that the Multiculturalism Act would not cost taxpayers more money. During the remainder of the NDP's mandate, no money from the General Revenue Fund was allocated to multiculturalism programs. The Multicultural Advisory Council that the Blakeney government had created to advise the cabinet on matters relating to multiculturalism was eliminated. In its place, the government created Saskculture as an arms-length agency responsible for the distribution of lottery funds to all cultural organizations in the province including ethnocultural associations (SK1997d; SK1997e; SK1997f; SK1999a; SK1999b). Non-for-profit cultural organizations joined Saskculture as voting members and democratically elected a 12 person Board of Directors which must have two representatives from ethnocultural communities. With little guidance or direction from the provincial government, Saskculture is now the sole policymaking body in regard to the distribution of lottery funds to support multiculturalism in Saskatchewan.

Saskculture has decided to ignore the civic republicanism aspects of the Multiculturalism Act and to re-create the liberal multicultural programs of the Blakeney and Devine eras that were eliminated due to Romanow's spending cuts. Based on the recommendation of a committee made up of representatives of ethnocultural associations, Saskculture has adopted a definition of multiculturalism that is very reflective of the liberal multiculturalism model. The definition stresses openness to experiencing and celebrating cultural differences; encouragement of cultural sharing; and respect for the right of "individuals and groups to maintain and practice their cultural heritage" (SK2008b). Following this definition, Saskculture provides funding to province-wide ethnocultural organizations (who may have local chapters), out-of-school heritage language programs, folk festivals, ethnocultural fine arts, and ethnocultural museums (SK 2000a; SK2001b; SK2002a; SK2003a; SK2004a; SK2005a; SK2006a; SK2007a; SK2008c). An analysis of Saskculture grants from 2000-2008 reveals that all funding given to ethnocultural associations went towards projects whose purpose could be classified as cultural preservation (Ibid.) as opposed to funding dedicated to civic republican purposes such as integrating newcomers into their host society.

For its part, the provincial government took a major step forward in the teaching of multiculturalism in Saskatchewan schools by adopting its first policy of multicultural education in 1994 that mixed liberal multicultural and civic republican themes. In terms of liberal multiculturalism, it stressed the importance of a society that "takes pride in its heritage" and asserts the "freedom of all individuals and groups to the retention and development of their cultures as a part of the Canadian identity" (SK1994b). Following civic republicanism, the policy speaks of the need to foster a commitment in students to "participate in the democratic process of government and

perform the duties of citizenship.” However, innovations in multicultural education were not high on the Department of Education’s list of priorities. Instead, the Department focused heavily on initiatives to improve the sensitivity of the educational system to those belonging to Aboriginal cultures and to educate all students concerning the contribution of Aboriginal peoples to Saskatchewan history and their treaty rights (SK1997b; SK2000b). Similarly, a 1994 policy on heritage languages did not commit the government to any expansion of heritage language instruction and put the onus on school boards and NGOs to organize and fund any new programs in this area (SK1994b). Recently, the Saskatchewan Department of Education has stopped using the term “heritage language” in favour of the term “international language.” This shift in vocabulary was accompanied by new high school curricula for Mandarin and Russian that it stated were warranted by the increasing economic and diplomatic importance of these languages (SK2000c; SK2001c).

Like previous Saskatchewan governments, the Romanow and Calvert governments left it up to the Saskatchewan Human Rights Commission (SHRC) to create and administer anti-racism programs in Saskatchewan. Besides the limited educational initiatives by the SHRC, the Department of Municipal Affairs developed a small grant program for community projects to address discrimination and racism (SK2000d). Near of the end of its term, the Calvert government began to draft an anti-racism strategy that came as a response to a recommendation in the Report of the Commission on First Nations and Métis Peoples and Justice Reform (SK2004b). Like the anti-racism component of Manitoba’s curriculum for K12 schools, this draft strategy was based on belief that the main axis of racism in Saskatchewan was racism against Aboriginal peoples (SK2008d).

Upon ascending to power in 2007, the Saskatchewan Party government under the leadership of Brad Wall commenced a review of Saskatchewan’s cultural policy. However, the documents surrounding the review have not emphasized the importance of multiculturalism to Saskatchewan’s culture and have made no suggestions on reforming Saskatchewan’s current programs in this area or changing the way that multiculturalism is funded (SK2008e; SK2009b; SK2010a). Instead, the stress has been on the promotion of First Nation and Métis culture and improving the profitability of cultural industries. Similarly, no changes have been made in the heritage language and anti-racism components of multiculturalism. The only notable development has been the Wall government’s quiet halting of work on the NDP’s anti-racism strategy (SK2009c).

Ultimately, there has not been a full-scale policy shift from liberal multiculturalism to civic republicanism in Saskatchewan. The economic and demographic circumstances of Saskatchewan led to ambivalence towards the national “crisis” of multiculturalism because immigrants were not an electorally important group and

deficit cutting was the top priority. The result has been a lack of coherence in its multiculturalism policy, as its Multiculturalism Act and K-12 multiculturalism curriculum reflect a civic republicanism ethos while Saskculture continues with programming reflecting a liberal multiculturalism ethos.

CONCLUSION

It is tempting to see the shift towards civic republicanism as part of a broader trend towards the retrenchment of the welfare state similar to what has happened in other areas of social policy or as an element of the dominance of neo-liberal ideology like Abu-Laban and Gabriel (2002) have found in their examination of federal multiculturalism policy. However, civic republicanism is not so much about the cutting of costs as the shifting of spending priorities. The Manitoba provincial government is spending relatively large sums of money on settling immigrants in a way that leads to the adoption of shared identity and shared values, and has reallocated its spending on grants to ethnocultural groups away from cultural preservation and towards intercultural exchange in order to construct an overarching “multicultural” Manitoba identity. Certainly, both the Saskatchewan and Manitoba governments justify their immigration policies on exclusively economic grounds similar to the federal government. However, the civic republican thrust within their multiculturalism policies is not necessarily connected to neo-liberal ideals of “individual self-sufficiency...competitiveness, efficiency, choice, and consumerism” (Abu-Laban and Gabriel 2002, 21). To the extent that it encourages newcomers to adopt shared values and identities, civic republicanism is actually quite unconcerned with neo-liberal ideals of choice and individualism. Civic republicanism is more concerned with building bonds of community and nation-building as opposed to consumerism and competitiveness.

Despite the overarching similarities with the evolution of federal multiculturalism policy, it is interesting to note how Saskatchewan and Manitoba have shaped their multiculturalism in reaction to their own circumstances and the variations in the evolution of multiculturalism between the two provinces. As immigration becomes a more “provincialized” policy area, the decisions that provincial governments make on how to manage the growing ethnic diversity in their jurisdictions will have important effects on newcomers to Canada. Civic republicanism, with its emphasis on integration, participation, and shared values, may become an increasingly popular model for these provincial governments, and more research at the provincial level in Canada may have to be done to understand such an important transformation.

APPENDIX A: MANITOBA AND SASKATCHEWAN PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT DOCUMENTS RELATING TO MULTICULTURALISM

Due to the large number of government documents analyzed, it is quite inconvenient to use the abbreviated in-text citation system. In the above text and this appendix, Manitoba and Saskatchewan provincial government documents are cited using the identifier they were assigned during the research process. The identifier consists of a two letter code for the province (SK= Saskatchewan and MB= Manitoba) followed by the document's year of publication and a lower case letter to distinguish the document from other documents that the provincial government published in the same year. The documents are listed chronologically below. While over 250 documents were consulted during researching this article, only those specifically cited in the text are included in this appendix.

Saskatchewan Government Documents

- SK1968a: Honourable Ross Thatcher, Premier of Saskatchewan, *Constitutional Conference Proceedings*, February 5-7.
- SK1973a: Government of Saskatchewan. *Report on the Proceedings of the Seminar '73: Multiculturalism in Saskatchewan...an opportunity for action, a challenge.*
- SK1974a: Government of Saskatchewan, *An Act Establishing the Saskatchewan Multicultural Advisory Council and the providing for Assistance to Individuals and Groups.*
- SK1974b: Paul Mostoway, NDP MLA, *Proceedings of the Saskatchewan Legislative Assembly*, April 25th, 1974.
- SK1974c: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1973-74.*
- SK1974d: Gordon MacMurchy, Minister of Education, *Proceedings of the Saskatchewan Legislative Assembly*, February 27th.
- SK1976a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1975-76.*
- SK1977a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1976-77.*
- SK1978a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1977-78.*
- SK1979a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1978-79.*
- SK1980a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1979-80.*
- SK1982a: Department of Culture and Youth, *Annual Report 1981-82.*
- SK1983a: Department of Culture and Recreation, *Annual Report 1982-1983.*
- SK1984a: Department of Culture and Recreation, *Annual Report 1983-1984.*
- SK1985a: Department of Culture and Recreation, *Annual Report 1983-1985.*
- SK1986a: Department of Culture and Recreation, *Annual Report 1983-1986.*
- SK1989a: Taskforce on Multiculturalism, *Multiculturalism in Saskatchewan: Report to Minister's Committee on Multiculturalism*, Regina.
- SK1990a: Department of Culture, Multiculturalism, and Recreation, *Annual Report 1989-1990.*
- SK1993a: Ad Hoc Cultural Restructuring Committee, *Cultural Renaissance: Building a Community, Ad Hoc Cultural Restructuring Committee Final Report*, October.
- SK1994a: Saskatchewan Municipal Government, *Annual Report 1993-1994.*
- SK1994b: Saskatchewan Education, Training and Employment, *Multicultural Education and Heritage Language Education Policies.*
- SK1995a: Saskatchewan Education, Training and Employment, New Release: "Training Programs Leading to Jobs", November 14th.
- SK1995b: Saskatchewan Municipal Government, *Annual Report 1994-1995.*
- SK1996a: Saskatchewan Municipal Government, Culture and Recreation Division, *Strategy for Achievement.*
- SK1996b: Saskatchewan Municipal Government, Culture and Recreation Division, *Strategy for Achievement Update.*
- SK1996c: Interim Heritage Council, *Perspectives on Heritage, Interim Heritage Council Discussion Paper*, June.

- SK1996d: Multiculturalism Legislation Framework Consultation Committee, *August 1996 Report*, submitted to Honourable Carol Teichrob, Minister of Municipal Affairs, August.
- SK1997a: Government of Saskatchewan, *The Multiculturalism Act*.
- SK1997b: Saskatchewan Education, *Our Children, Our Communities, and Our Future: Equity in Education, A Policy Framework*.
- SK1997c: Carol Teichrob, Minister of Municipal Government, *Proceedings of the Saskatchewan Legislative Assembly*, April 23.
- SK1997d: SaskCulture Transition Committee, *SaskCulture: A Proposed Framework*, February.
- SK1997e: Cultural Industries Development Strategy Committee, *Saskatchewan Cultural Industries Development Strategy*.
- SK1997f: The Saskatchewan Arts Board, *Provincial Funding to Arts and Culture in Saskatchewan: A Systematic Approach*.
- SK1999a: Interim Heritage Council, *A New Vision for Saskatchewan's Heritage*, January.
- SK1999b: Government of Saskatchewan, *Strengthening Culture Through a Commitment to People*.
- SK2000a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 1999-2000*.
- SK2000b: Saskatchewan Education, *Aboriginal Education Initiatives in Saskatchewan Education*.
- SK2000c: Saskatchewan Education, *Russian 10: A Curriculum Guide for International Languages*.
- SK2000d: Saskatchewan Municipal Affairs, Culture and Housing, *Annual Report 1999-2000*.
- SK2001a: Saskatchewan Economic and Co-operative Development, *Annual Report, 2000-2001*.
- SK2001b: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2000-2001*.
- SK2001c: Saskatchewan Education, *Mandarin 10, 20, 30: A Curriculum Guide for International Languages*.
- SK2002a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2001-2002*.
- SK2003a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2002-2003*.
- SK2004a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2003-2004*.
- SK2004b: Commission on First Nations and Métis Peoples and Justice Reform, *Report of the Commission on First Nations and Métis Peoples and Justice Reform*.
- SK2005a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2004-2005*.
- SK2006a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2005-2006*.
- SK2007a: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2007-2008*.
- SK2008a: Ministry of Advanced Education, Employment, and Labour, *The Saskatchewan Labour Force Supply*.
- SK2008b: Saskculture, *SaskCulture Cultural Policy*, November.
- SK2008c: Saskculture, *Annual Report 2007-2008*.
- SK2008d: Ministry of Justice and Attorney General, *Annual Report 2007-2008*.
- SK2008e: Saskatchewan Ministry of Tourism, Parks, Culture and Sport, *Draft Cultural Policy Planning Framework*.
- SK2009a: Saskatchewan Labour Market Commission. *Labour Market in Saskatchewan: A Situational Analysis*, May.
- SK2009b: Saskatchewan Ministry of Tourism, Parks, Culture and Sport, *Reflections: A Summary of Survey Results*.
- SK2009c: Standing Committee on Intergovernmental Affairs and Justice, *Hansard Verbatim Report*, No. 15, March 30.
- SK2010a: Saskatchewan Ministry of Tourism, Parks, Culture and Sport, *Pride of Saskatchewan: A Policy Where Culture, Commerce and Community Meet*.

Manitoba Government Documents

- MB1970a: Government of Manitoba. *Speech from the Throne*, Read by Lieutenant-Governor William John McKeag, March 12.
- MB1970b: Secretariat on Dominion-Provincial-Cultural Relations. *Report of Manitoba Mosaic*, October 13-17.
- MB1971a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1970-1971*.

- MB1972a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1971-1972*.
- MB1973a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1972-1973*.
- MB1974a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1973-1974*.
- MB1975a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1974-1975*.
- MB1976a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1975-1976*.
- MB1977a: Department of Tourism, Recreation, and Cultural Affairs, *Annual Report for Fiscal Year 1976-1977*.
- MB1985a: Honourable Eugene Kostyra, *Philosophy, Principles, Programs*, Speech Delivered to the Federal/Provincial/Territorial Conference on Multiculturalism, May 13-14th.
- MB1985b: Manitoba Intercultural Council, *Manitoba Intercultural Council Recommendations*.
- MB1985c: Manitoba Intercultural Council, *Lotteries Committee Report on the Manitoba Intercultural Council and the Gaming System*.
- MB1986a: Community Resource Allocation Committee, Manitoba Intercultural Council, *Report to Manitoba's Ethnocultural Communities on the Ethnocultural Community Support Fund*.
- MB1988a: Manitoba Culture, Heritage and Recreation, *Multiculturalism is for All Manitobans: Towards a Horizontal Mosaic, A Report of the Manitoba Task Force on Multiculturalism*, Submitted to the Minister of Culture, Heritage and Recreation, the Honourable Bonnie Mitchelson, August.
- MB1989a: Beate Schiffer-Graham, *The Ethnic Knights of the Round Table: A Case Study of the Manitoba Intercultural Council as an Advisory Agency to Government*, Manitoba Legislative Internship Programme, June.
- MB1990a: Government of Manitoba, *Manitoba's Policy for A Multicultural Society: Building Pride, Equality and Partnership*.
- MB1992a: Curriculum Services Branch, Manitoba Education and Training, *Heritage Language Programs in Manitoba*.
- MB1992b: Government of Manitoba, *The Manitoba Multiculturalism Act*.
- MB1992c: Various Speakers, *Hansards from the Manitoba Legislative Assembly*, June 10th.
- MB1992e: Minutes of Standing Committee on Law Amendments, Manitoba Legislative Assembly, June 23-24.
- MB1992f: Manitoba Education and Training, *Policy for Heritage Language Instruction*.
- MB1992g: Multiculturalism Secretariat, *Annual Report 1991-1992*.
- MB1992h: Manitoba Education and Training, *Multicultural Education: A Policy for the 1990s*.
- MB1992i: Manitoba Intercultural Council, *Perceptions and Evolution of Multiculturalism in Canada: 1971 - 1991*, February.
- MB1993a: Multiculturalism Secretariat, *Annual Report 1992-1993*.
- MB1993b: Manitoba Education and Training, *Funding Policy for Language Programs*.
- MB1994a: Manitoba Culture, Heritage, and Tourism, *Immigration: Building Together, Strengthening our Future*.
- MB1998b: Manitoba Culture, Heritage, and Citizenship, *1997-1998 Annual Report*.
- MB1999a: Manitoba Culture, Heritage, and Citizenship *1998-1999 Annual Report*.
- MB2001a: Business Council of Manitoba, A "Made in Manitoba" Immigration Policy, Presented to Premier Gary Doer, March 20.
- MB2004a: Margot Morrish, Director of Strategic Planning and Program Support for the Immigration and Multiculturalism Division of Manitoba Labour and Immigration, *Manitoba Immigration and Integration Policies and Programs*, Presentation to the Immigrant Inclusion Conference, Calgary, November 1st.
- MB2005a: Department of Federal-Provincial & International Relations, *Reaching Beyond our Borders: The Framework for Manitoba's International Activities*.
- MB2006b: Manitoba Education, Citizenship, and Youth, *Belonging, Learning, and Growing: Kindergarten to Grade 12 Action Plan for Ethnocultural Equity*.

- MB2007a: Department of Finance, *Manitoba's Action Strategy for Economic Growth*.
 MB2007b: Manitoba Labour and Immigration, *Annual Report 2006-2007*.
 MB2007c: Manitoba Labour and Immigration, *Manitoba Settlement Strategy*.
 MB2008a: Manitoba Labour and Immigration, *Annual Report 2007-2008*.
 MB2008b: Manitoba Labour and Immigration, *Manitoba Immigration Facts: 2007 Statistical Report*.
 MB2008c: Personal correspondence with Vivian Salangang, Multiculturalism Secretariat, Manitoba Labour and Immigration, Government of Manitoba, February 15.
 MB2008d: Manitoba Education, Citizenship and Youth, *A Statistical Profile of Education in Manitoba September 2002 to June 2007*.
 MB2008e: Manitoba Education, Citizenship and Youth, *Annual Report 2007-2008*.

WORKS CITED

- Abu-Laban, Yasmeen, and Christina Gabriel. 2002. *Selling Diversity: Immigration, Multiculturalism, Employment Equity and Globalization*. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Abu-Laban, Yasmeen, and Daiva Stasiulis. 1992. Ethnic Pluralism under Siege: Popular and Partisan Opposition to Multiculturalism. *Canadian Public Policy* 18.4: 365-386.
- Adams, Christopher. 2008. *Politics in Manitoba: Parties, Leaders, and Voters*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press.
- Alexandra, Paul. 1990. Multiculturalism Policy Divisive, Dobbie Says. *The Winnipeg Free Press*, Oct. 7, A1.
- Anderson, Alan. 2005. Aboriginal Population Trends. In *Encyclopaedia of Saskatchewan*, 10-11. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre.
- Biles, John, Meyer Burstein, James Frideres, Erin Tolley, and Robert Vineberg. 2011. *Integration and Inclusion of Newcomers and Minorities across Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Blakeney, Allan, and Sanford Borins. 1998. *Political Management in Canada: Conversations in Statecraft*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Bruno-Jofre, Rose. 1998-1999. Citizenship and Schooling in Manitoba, 1918-1945. *Manitoba History* 36 (Autumn/Winter): 26-36.
- Caccia, Ivana. 2010. *Managing the Canadian Mosaic in Wartime: Shaping Citizenship Policy, 1939-1945*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Coates, Ken, and Fred McGuiness. 1987. *Manitoba: The Province and its People*. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers.
- Day, Richard. 2000. *Multiculturalism and the History of Canadian Diversity*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Doern, Russell. 1985. *The Battle over Bilingualism: The Manitoba Language Question, 1983-1985*. Winnipeg: Cambridge Publishers.
- Elliott, Doug. 2003. *Demographic Trends in Saskatchewan: A Statistical Analysis of Population, Migration, and Immigration*. Regina: Saskatchewan Intergovernmental and Aboriginal Affairs.
- Fleras, Augie. 2009. *The Politics of Multiculturalism: Multicultural Governance in Comparative Perspective*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Fleras, Augie, and Jean Leonard Elliott. 2002. *Engaging Diversity: Multiculturalism in Canada*. Toronto: Nelson Thomson Learning.
- Forbes, Hugh Donald. 2007. Trudeau as the First Theorist of Canadian Multiculturalism. In *Multiculturalism and the Canadian Constitution*, ed. Stephen Tierney, 10-11. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Gagnon, Alain-G., and Raffaeale Iacovino. 2007. *Federalism, Citizenship and Quebec: Debating Multinationalism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Garcea, Joseph. 2006. Provincial Multiculturalism Policies in Canada, 1974-2004: A Content Analysis. *Canadian Ethnic Studies/Études Ethnique au Canada* 38.3: 1-20.
- Garcea, Joseph, and Neil Hibbert. 2011. Policy Frameworks for Managing Diversity in Society: Taking Stock for Taking Action. In *Integration and Inclusion of Newcomers and Minorities across Canada*, ed. J. Biles, M. Burstein, J. Frideres, E. Tolley, and R. Vineberg. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

- Hébert, Raymond. 2004. *Manitoba French Language Crisis: A Cautionary Tale*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Press.
- Honohan, Iseult. 2002. *Civic Republicanism*. New York: Routledge.
- Jaenen, Cornelius. 1978. The Manitoba Schools Question: An Ethnic Interpretation. In *Ethnic Canadians: Culture and Education*, ed. Martin Kovacs, 317-331. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center.
- Karmis, Dimitrios. 2004. Pluralism and National Identity (ies) in Contemporary Quebec: Conceptual Clarification, Typology and Discourse Analysis. In *Quebec: State and Society*, 3rd ed., ed. A. Gagnon, 69-96. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Kernerman, Gerald. 2006. *Multicultural Nationalism: Civilizing Difference, Constituting Community*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Kordan, Bohdan. 2011. Assessing the Multiculturalism/Immigration Policy Nexus in Saskatchewan. In *New Directions in Saskatchewan Public Policy*, ed. D. McGrane, 53-72. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre.
- Leeson, Howard. 1990. Saskatchewan in Transition. In *Canada: The State of the Federation 1990*, ed. Ronald Watts and Douglas Brown, 177-198. Kingston: Institute of Governmental Relations.
- Marchildon, Gregory. 2004. Roy Romanow. In *Premiers of the Twentieth Century*, ed. Gordon Barnhart, 353-394. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre.
- McLeod, Keith. 1968. Politics, Schools and the French Language, 1881-1931. In *Politics in Saskatchewan*, ed. Norman Ward and Duff Spafford, 124-150. Don Mills: Longman Publishing.
- Pal, Leslie. 1993. *Interest of State: The Politics of Language, Multiculturalism, and Feminism*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Paquet, Gilles. 2008. *Deep Cultural Diversity: A Governance Challenge*. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press.
- Patrias, Carmela. 2006. Socialist, Jews, and the 1947 Saskatchewan Bill of Rights. *The Canadian Historical Review* 87.2: 265-292.
- Peterson, Tom. 1972. Ethnic and Class Politics in Manitoba. In *Canadian Provincial Politics: The Party Systems in the Ten Provinces*, ed. Martin Robin, 70-89. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall.
- Regehr, Ted. 2004. William M. Martin. In *Premiers of the Twentieth Century*, ed. Gordon Barnhart, 39-68. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre.
- Roy, Patricia. 1995. The Fifth Force: Multiculturalism and the English Canadian Identity. *The Annals of the American Academy* 538: 199-209.
- Russell, Frances. 2003. *The Canadian Crucible: Manitoba's Role in Canada's Great Divide*. Winnipeg: Heartland Associates.
- Ryan, Phil. 2010. *Multicultiphobia*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Smith, David E. 1975. *Prairie Liberalism: The Liberal Party in Saskatchewan*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Stasiulis, Daiva, and Radha Jhappan. 1995. The Fractious Politics of a Settler Society: Canada. In *Unsettling Settler Societies: Articulations of Gender, Race, Ethnicity and Class*, ed. Daiva Stasiulis, Nira Yuval-Davis, and Ruth Helm, 95-131. London: Sage Publications.
- Statistics Canada. 2003. *Canada's Ethnocultural Portrait: The Changing Mosaic, 2001 Census*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada. <http://www5.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=96F0030X2001008&lang=eng>
- Trudeau, Pierre. 1971. Statement on Multiculturalism Policy. *House of Commons Debates*, October 8: 8545-6.
- Waiser, Bill. 2009. The Myth of Multiculturalism. In *Perspectives of Saskatchewan*, ed. Jene Porter, 57-74. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press.
- Winter, Elke. 2007. Neither "America" nor "Quebec": Constructing the Canadian Multicultural Nation. *Nations and Nationalism* 13.3: 481-503.
- Winter, Elke. 2011. *Us, Them, and Others: Pluralism and National Identity in Diverse Societies*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Wiseman, Nelson. 1983. *Social Democracy in Manitoba: A History of the CCF-NDP*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press.
- Wiseman, Nelson. 1994. In Search of Manitoba's Constitutional Position, 1950-1990. *Journal of Canadian Studies* 29.3: 85-107.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to thank his colleague, Dr. Bohdan Kordan, for his insightful suggestions on this project, as well as Emily Champ and Paula Streckler for their excellent research assistance. I would also like to thank the anonymous reviewer for their extensive and helpful suggestions.

DAVID MCGRANE holds an undergraduate degree in Political Science from the University of Regina and a Master's degree in Political Science from York University in Toronto. In 2007, he completed his Ph.D. in Political Science at Carleton University in Ottawa and began an appointment as a tenure-track Assistant Professor in Political Studies at St. Thomas More College and the University of Saskatchewan. Dr. McGrane frequently comments in the media on federal and provincial politics and teaches classes in North American politics, Canadian political parties, federalism, and provincial politics. His research interests include federal-provincial fiscal relations, social democracy, Québécois nationalism, Western Canadian alienation, multiculturalism, provincial elections, and childcare.